

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

LG.PHILIPS LCD CO., LTD.,

Plaintiff/Counterclaim Defendant,

v.

TATUNG COMPANY;  
TATUNG COMPANY OF AMERICA, INC.;  
CHUNGHWA PICTURE TUBES, LTD.;  
AND VIEWSONIC CORPORATION,

Defendants/Counterclaim Plaintiffs.

Civil Action No. 05-292 (JJF)

REDACTED

**PLAINTIFF'S OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION *IN LIMINE* (No. 3)  
TO PRECLUDE LPL FROM SOLICITING OR OFFERING ANY TESTIMONY,  
EVIDENCE, OR ARGUMENT RELATING TO ANY ALLEGED CUSTOMER  
RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN VIEWSONIC AND CPT**

THE BAYARD FIRM  
Richard D. Kirk (#922)  
222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 900  
P.O. Box 25130  
Wilmington, DE 19899-5130  
(302) 429-4208

Counsel for Plaintiff  
LG.PHILIPS LCD CO., LTD.

OF COUNSEL:  
Gaspare J. Bono  
Matthew T. Bailey  
Cass W. Christenson  
McKenna Long & Aldridge LLP  
1900 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
(202) 496-7500 (Telephone)  
(202) 496-7756 (Facsimile)

June 30, 2006

Plaintiff LG.Philips LCD Co., Ltd. ("LPL"), opposes Defendants' Motion *in Limine* (No. 3) to Preclude LPL from Soliciting or Offering any Testimony, Evidence, or Argument Relating to any Alleged Customer Relationship Between ViewSonic and CPT (the "Motion"). and this relationship is relevant to the importation and sale of infringing products in the U.S. The Court thus should deny Defendants' Motion in all respects.

**I. DEFENDANTS' MOTIONS *IN LIMINE* IMPROPERLY SEEK LEGAL RULINGS ON BROAD ISSUES AND FAIL TO SHOW UNDUE PREJUDICE**

Defendants have filed seven (7) motions in limine on broad subjects. Pretrial motions to exclude evidence lack trial context and are rarely granted. *See In re Diet Drugs Prods. Liab. Litig.*, 369 F.3d 293, 314 (3d Cir. 2004) (pretrial exclusion under FRE 403 "is an extreme measure"); *In re Paoli R.R. Yard PCB Litig.*, 916 F.2d 829, 859 (3d Cir. 1990). Defendants' motions improperly seek to undercut LPL's ability to argue and present its case, instead of presenting narrow evidentiary issues. *See T.V.T. Records v. Island Def Jam Music Group*, 250 F. Supp. 2d 341, 344 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (motions in limine should not be used "as preemptive weapons . . . to strike in shotgun fashion at whole topics," effectively requiring "a form of advance trial of substantive" issues). Further, Defendants' motions fail to establish any undue prejudice. *See Ansell v. Green Acres Contracting Co.*, 347 F.3d 515, 525 (3d Cir. 2003) (explaining that "[p]rejudice does not simply mean damage to the opponent's cause[,] otherwise, "most relevant evidence would be deemed prejudicial.") (quoting *Goodman v. Pa. Turnpike Comm'n*, 293 F.3d 655, 670 (3d Cir. 2002)). This Motion, like Defendants' other motions in limine, broadly and impermissibly seeks to foreclose LPL from presenting relevant and admissible evidence, and should be denied.

**II.**



**III. CONCLUSION**

Accordingly, for all the foregoing reasons, Defendants' Motion should be denied.

June 30, 2006

THE BAYARD FIRM

/s/ Richard D. Kirk (rk0922)  
Richard D. Kirk (#922)  
222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 900  
P.O. Box 25130  
Wilmington, DE 19899-5130  
(302) 655-5000  
rkirk@bayardfirm.com

Counsel for Plaintiff  
LG.PHILIPS LCD CO., LTD.

OF COUNSEL:

Gaspare J. Bono  
Matthew T. Bailey  
Cass W. Christenson  
McKenna Long & Aldridge LLP  
1900 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
(202) 496-7500

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned counsel certifies that, on June 30, 2006, he electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using CM/ECF, which will send automatic notification of the filing to the following:

Robert W. Whetzel, Esq.  
Matthew W. King, Esq.  
Richards, Layton & Finger  
One Rodney Square  
P.O. Box 551  
Wilmington, DE 19899

The undersigned counsel further certifies that copies of the foregoing document were sent on June 30, 2006 by email and by hand to the above counsel and by email and first class mail to the following non-registered participants:

Christine A. Dudzik, Esq.  
Thomas W. Jenkins, Esq.  
Howrey LLP  
321 North Clark Street  
Suite 3400  
Chicago, IL 60610

Teresa M. Corbin, Esq.  
Glenn W. Rhodes, Esq.  
Julie Gabler, Esq.  
Howrey LLP  
525 Market Street  
Suite 3600  
San Francisco, CA 94105

/s/ Richard D. Kirk (rk0922)  
Richard D. Kirk

# Exhibit 1

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

## Exhibit 2

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

# Exhibit 3

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

# Exhibit 4

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

# Exhibit 5

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

# Exhibit 6

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

# Exhibit 7

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

# Exhibit 8

## CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENT

These pages have been removed because they contain confidential information subject to the Protective Order.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned counsel certifies that, on August 18, 2006, he electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using CM/ECF, which will send automatic notification of the filing to the following:

Robert W. Whetzel, Esq.  
Matthew W. King, Esq.  
Richards, Layton & Finger  
One Rodney Square  
P.O. Box 551  
Wilmington, DE 19899

The undersigned counsel further certifies that copies of the foregoing document were sent on August 18, 2006 by email and by hand to the above counsel and by email and first class mail to the following non-registered participants:

Christine A. Dudzik, Esq.	Teresa M. Corbin, Esq.
Thomas W. Jenkins, Esq.	Glenn W. Rhodes, Esq.
Howrey LLP	Julie Gabler, Esq.
321 North Clark Street	Howrey LLP
Suite 3400	525 Market Street
Chicago, IL 60610	Suite 3600
	San Francisco, CA 94105

/s/ Richard D. Kirk (rk0922)  
Richard D. Kirk